



9th International Conference on Predictive Modelling in Food

Modelling the fate of *Listeria monocytogenes* in beef meat stored at refrigeration temperatures under different packaging conditions

Cristina Saraiva^{a,*}, Maria da Conceição Fontes^a, Luis Patarata^a, Conceição Martins^a, Vasco Cadavez^b and Ursula Gonzales-Barron^b

^aSchool of Agrarian and Veterinary Sciences, DCV, CECAV, Centro de Ciência Animal e Veterinária, Universidade de Trás-os-Montes e Alto Douro, Quinta de Prados, 5000-801 Vila Real, Portugal, www.utad.pt;

^bCIMO Mountain Research Centre, School of Agriculture, Polytechnic Institute of Bragança, Campus de Santa Apolónia, Apartado 1172, 5301-854 Bragança, Portugal

Abstract

The objective of this study was to model the fate of *L. monocytogenes* inoculated in beef at two concentrations (2.5 and 4.0 log CFU/g), packaged under aerobic, vacuum and three modified atmosphere combinations – 70% O₂/20% CO₂/10% N₂, 50% O₂/40% CO₂/10% N₂ and 30% O₂/60% CO₂/10% N₂, and refrigerated at a normal temperature (4°C) and at a mild abuse temperature (9°C). An omnibus model based on the three-parameter Weibull equation proved statistically that *L. monocytogenes* survives better in vacuum (VP) than in aerobic conditions, although without significant difference in its ability to survive in the temperature range between 4°C and 9°C. Furthermore, regardless of the refrigeration temperature, the presence of CO₂ in package atmosphere exerted a bactericidal effect on *L. monocytogenes* cells, being approximately 1.5 log of reduction when storage time reached 10 days. Since the pathogen can survive in VP/MAP beef at refrigerated storage, there is a need of maintaining its numbers below 100 CFU/g before packaging by placing efforts on the implementation of control measures during processing.

© 2016 Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

Peer-review under responsibility of Department of Food Science, Faculty of Food Engineering, University of Campinas.

Keywords: *Listeria monocytogenes*; Packaging; Weibull; survival; predictive microbiology

* Corresponding author. Tel.: +351 259 350 659; fax: +351 259 350 480.
E-mail address: crisarai@utad.pt

1. Introduction

Listeria monocytogenes is a Gram-positive anaerobic facultative food-borne pathogen which is widely distributed in nature ⁽¹⁾. This bacteria is able to survive in environments with pH between 4.0 and 9.6 ⁽²⁾ and at temperatures below freezing, growing from 1°C to 45°C ⁽³⁾. Refrigerated meats, ready-to-eat meat (RTE) foods, milk and cheeses, cold-cut meats, smoked fish and seafood, have been implicated in isolated cases of listeriosis ^(4,5). A recent systematic review and meta-analysis on the incidence of pathogens in Portuguese meats revealed that incidence average of *L. monocytogenes* in beef meat is 17.6%, and in meat products is 8.8% ⁽⁶⁾. Although the concentrations are unknown, and may as well be low, these high prevalence estimates may represent a considerable risk due to the common practice among consumers of eating rare meat (i.e., undercooked) which could not destroy *L. monocytogenes*, if present. According to European Communities Commission ⁽⁷⁾, *L. monocytogenes* must not be exceeded the limit of 2 log CFU/g at the end of the shelf-life in RTE. It is assumed that the temperature, the ultimate pH, the film permeability and gaseous composition of packaging are important parameters that affect the growth of microorganisms in packaged raw meat ⁽⁸⁾. It is well known that the composition of MAP systems can be an effective way to restrict the growth of spoilage aerobic organisms ^(8,9). But, the extended shelf-life of refrigerated meats under VP and MAP conditions has raised concerns about the survival dynamics of *L. monocytogenes*. The aim of this work was to assess, by means of predictive microbiology modelling, the effect of packaging on the dynamics of *L. monocytogenes* inoculated at low and high level in beef meat stored at a normal refrigeration temperature (4°C) and a mild abusive temperature (9°C).

2. Material and methods

2.1. Preparation of meat samples

Longissimus dorsi (LD) muscles were obtained from carcasses of eight Portuguese bulls (9 to 11 months) at 24 h *post mortem*. Muscles were cut into pieces of approximately 200 g and two samples of each piece were immediately (24h *post mortem*) investigated for the presence of *Listeria monocytogenes* according to ISO 11290-1 ⁽¹⁰⁾. If at least one positive-sample were detected, all piece cuts were totally excluded from the inoculation experiments. Meat samples were prepared by removing a layer of ~1cm from the meat surface, and aseptically cut in small meat pieces.

2.2. Preparation of inoculum and inoculation procedure

L. monocytogenes (ATCC 7973) stock culture was cultured on tryptone soy agar (TSA, England) slants at 4°C, which were replaced every 30 days. A single colony was transferred from the slants to 10 ml Brain Heart Infusion (BHI) broth (Oxoid CM225, England) (37°C, 24 h), followed by a second activation step in BHI (37°C, 18 h) to achieve a viable cell population of 9 log CFU/ml. The culture was centrifuged at 10,000× g for 10 min at 4°C. The supernatant was decanted and the sediment suspended in 0.1% peptone water (Merck, Germany). The washing step was repeated twice. The suspension of washed cells was diluted in a sterile 0.1% peptone solution to obtain an optical density of 0.5 (600 nm, 10 mm). Serial dilutions were performed to yield approximately 2.5 or 4 log CFU/g.

Each piece of beef was placed into individually package and dropped in the center with 20 µl bacterial suspension of *L. monocytogenes*. The entire procedure was repeated to obtain a low inoculation level (2.5 log CFU/g) and a high inoculation level (4.0 log CFU/g). Each bag of beef was massaged manually and then bags were heat-sealed.

2.3. Packaging

Inoculated samples were packed in air (A), vacuum (VP) and modified atmosphere packaging 70% O₂/20% CO₂/10% N₂ (MAP_{70/20}), 50% O₂/40% CO₂/10% N₂ (MAP_{50/40}) and 30% O₂/60% CO₂/10% N₂ (MAP_{30/60}). For air-packaged samples, meat cuts were accommodated in a tray overwrapped with polyethylene film, while for VP and MAP samples, meat cuts were individually packaged in COMBITHERM bags (WIPAK Walsrode, HAFRI). Meat samples were packaged using a SAMMIC V-420 SGA machine, with a gas-to-meat ratio of ~3:1. Samples were stored at 4±0.5°C and 9±0.5°C, and examined for *Listeria monocytogenes* counts at days 1, 3, 7, 10, 14, 21 and 28, depending on the packaging system.

2.4. Microbiological analysis

At each time point, samples were homogenised with 20-ml sterile buffered peptone water (BPW) in a stomacher (IUL, Barcelona, Spain) during 90s at room temperature. Serial decimal dilutions were prepared in BPW, and duplicate 0.1 ml samples were then plated onto Compass *L. monocytogenes* agar (Biokar BM06508). After incubation at 37°C for 48 h, typical colonies were counted and results were expressed as log CFU/g.

2.5. Modelling the survival of *L. monocytogenes*

The survival of *L. monocytogenes* in inoculated beef meat of normal pH was modelled using the Weibull exponential decay function as the primary predictive microbiology model (i.e., a model describing microbial concentration as a function of time). This survival model has been increasingly used because of its simplicity, ease of fit, and capability of modelling concave and convex survival curves⁽¹¹⁾. The factors “Inoc”, “Pack” and “T” predicting the Weibull model’s parameters were added to the omnibus model one by one while assessing the improvement in the goodness-of-fit measures (log-likelihood, Akaike Information Criterion [AIC] and BIC) and the behaviour of the residuals. The model was adjusted in R version 2.14.2 (R Development Core Team).

3. Results and Discussion

The survival studies showed overall that the population numbers of *L. monocytogenes* actually decreased during storage of raw beef at refrigeration temperature, suggesting that the packaging environment, product characteristics and, eventually, interactions with other competitive microbiota were not favourable for the growth of this pathogen. The three-parameter Weibull model was able to closely represent the survival experimental curves of inoculated *L. monocytogenes* in beef for each of the twenty conditions (i.e., defined as combinations of storage temperature, level of inoculum and packaging types).

The omnibus regression evidenced that the level of inoculum did not affect the parameter values of the Weibull model. The estimated means of Log N₀ for the high (4.045) and low (2.560) inoculum corresponded closely to the target concentrations of *L. monocytogenes* inoculated (~4.0 and 2.5 log CFU/g) in the experiments.

The omnibus model inferred that the survival of *L. monocytogenes* in vacuum packaging (Pack.V intercept of 2.625) was significantly better than in aerobic conditions (Pack.A=2.142). Comparable findings were reported by Uppal et al.⁽¹²⁾ in turkey tenders. The omnibus regression model also confirmed that the reduction of *L. monocytogenes* in any of the MAP treatments was significantly greater than in the air-packaged meat samples. Furthermore, the intercept estimates for MAP70/20 (1.771), MAP50/40 (1.666) and MAP30/60 (1.395) decreased progressively because a higher CO₂ concentration had a greater effect on decreasing the *L. monocytogenes* population in packaged raw beef; and this occurred regardless of the refrigeration temperature evaluated. The effective inhibition of *L. monocytogenes* in raw meats by CO₂ has been pointed out by several authors^(13, 14).

The effect of the temperature in the curve decay is weak, for a fixed inoculum level and packaging type, and this is reflected on the very low estimate of the temperature effect (-0.026). The negative value of the estimate only reflects the inverse relationship; this is, the higher the temperature, the lower the first decimal reduction time.

In this work, there was a decrease in *L. monocytogenes* numbers during refrigerated storage. One of the factors that may have contributed to the progressive reduction of *L. monocytogenes* in MAP, as opposed to the absence of growth previously reported⁽⁹⁾ may have been the lower oxygen transmission rate (OTR=1.0 cm³m²day⁻¹) of the packaging film used in this work for MAP. Other factors that may have contributed to the decrease in *L. monocytogenes* observed in MAP could have been the high gas-to-meat ratio (3:1) for the small meat sample used in the package.

Generally, under anaerobic modified atmosphere, lactic acid bacteria have shown to be effective in inhibiting the growth of pathogenic bacteria such as *L. monocytogenes* in meat⁽¹⁵⁾.

4. Conclusions

The model proved that VP was significantly less efficient than MAP in reducing *L. monocytogenes* numbers in raw beef, while higher CO₂ concentrations in MAP exerted a greater bactericidal effect regardless of the refrigeration temperature. The omnibus model inferred that this pathogen survived significantly better in vacuum than in aerobic conditions, which can be due to its facultative anaerobic nature, and to the better development of spoilage bacteria in air packaging.

Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank CECAV-UTAD and the research is supported by national funds by Portuguese Foundation for Science and Technology (FCT), under the PEst-OE/AGR/UI0772/2014.

Dr. Gonzales-Barron wishes to acknowledge the financial support provided by the FCT through the award of a five-year Investigator Fellowship (IF) in the mode of Development Grants (IF/00570).

References

1. Donnelly CW. *Listeria monocytogenes*. In Foodborne Disease handbook (eds. Hui, Y.H., Pierson M.D. and Gorham, J.R.). Marcel Dekker Inc, New York; 2001. p. 213-245.
2. Farber JM., Peterkin PI. *Listeria monocytogenes*, a food-borne pathogen. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* 1991; **55**:476-511.
3. Farber J.M., Coates F, Daley E. Minimum water activity requirements for the growth of *Listeria monocytogenes*. *Lett. Appl. Microbiol* 1992; **15**:103-105.
4. European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) (2015). The European Union summary report on trends and sources of zoonoses, zoonotic agents and foodborne outbreaks in 2013. **13**:3991.
5. Martins EA, Germano PML. *Listeria monocytogenes* in ready-to-eat, sliced, cooked ham and salami products, marketed in the city of São Paulo, Brazil: Occurrence, quantification and serotyping. *Food Control* 2011; **22**:297-302.
6. Xavier C, Gonzales-Barron U, Paula V, Estevinho L, Cadavez V. Meta-analysis of the incidence of food-borne pathogens in Portuguese meats and their products. *Food Res. Int.* 2014; **55**:311-323.
7. Commission of the European Communities (2008). Commission Staff Working Document. Guidance Document SANCO/1628/2008.
8. McMillin KW. Where is MAP Going? A review and future potential of modified atmosphere packaging for meat. *Meat Sci.* 2008; **80**:43-65.
9. Tsigarida E, Skandamis P, Nychas GJE. Behaviour of *Listeria monocytogenes* and autochthonous flora on meat stored under aerobic, vacuum and modified atmosphere packaging conditions with or without the presence of oregano essential oil at 5°C. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 2000; **89**:901-909.
10. ISO 11290-1 (1996). Microbiology of food and animal feeding stuffs—horizontal method for the detection and enumeration of *Listeria monocytogenes* - Part 1: Detection method. International Organization for Standardization, Geneva.
11. Couvert S, Gaillard S, Savy N, Mafart P, Leguerinel I. Survival curves of heated bacterial spores: Effect of environmental factors on Weibull parameters. *Int. J. Food Microbiol* 2005; **101**:73-81.
12. Uppal KK, Getty KJK, Boyle EAE, Harper NM, Lobaton-Sulabo ASS, Barry B. Effect of packaging and storage time on survival of *Listeria monocytogenes* on kippered beef steak and turkey tenders. *J. Food Sci.* 2012; **71**:57-60.
13. Bennik MHJ, Smid EJ, Rombouts FM. (). Gorris, L.G.M. Growth of psychrotrophic foodborne pathogens in a solid surface model system under the influence of carbon dioxide and oxygen. *Food Microb.* 1995; **12**:509-519.
14. Nissen H, Alvseike O, Bredholt S, Holck A, Nesbakken T. Comparison between the growth of *Yersinia enterocolitica*, *Listeria monocytogenes*, *Escherichia coli* O157:H7 and *Salmonella* spp. in ground beef packed by three commercially used packaging techniques. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 2000; **59**:211-220.
15. Phillips CA. Review: Modified Atmosphere Packaging and its effects on the microbiological quality and safety produce. *Int. J. Food Sci. Tecnol.* 1996; **31**:463-479.