The Role of Polyfunctionality in the Formation of [Ch]Cl-Carboxylic Acid-Based Deep Eutectic Solvents

Emanuel A. Crespo, Liliana P. Silva, Mónia A. R. Martins, Mark Bülow, Olga Ferreira, Gabriele Sadowski, Christoph Held, Simão P. Pinho, and João A. P. Coutinho

Abstract: Aiming at providing an extensive characterization of the solid–liquid equilibria (SLE) of deep eutectic solvents (DESs), the phase diagrams of nine eutectic mixtures composed of choline chloride ([Ch]Cl) and (poly)carboxylic acids, commonly reported in the literature as DESs, were measured experimentally. Contrarily to the behavior reported for eutectic mixtures composed of [Ch]Cl (hydrogen-bond acceptor, HBA) and monofunctional hydrogen-bond donors (HBD) such as fatty acids and fatty alcohols, which have recently been shown to be almost ideal mixtures, a significant decrease of the melting temperature, at the eutectic point, was observed for most of the systems studied. This melting temperature depression was attributed to a pronounced nonideality of the liquid phase induced by the strong hydrogen-bond interactions between the two mixture components. Perturbed-chain statistical associating fluid theory (PC-SAFT) was used to describe these interactions physically. PC-SAFT allowed accurately modeling the experimental phase diagrams over the entire concentration and temperature ranges. Depending on the kind of mixture, up to two temperature-independent binary interaction parameters between HBA and HBD were applied. The PC-SAFT approach was used to provide trustworthy information on the nonideality of the liquid phase (expressed as the activity coefficients of HBA and HBD) as well as to estimate the eutectic points coordinates. The experimental data along with the modeling results allowed us to infer about the importance of the HBD’s chemical structure on the formation of [Ch]Cl-based DESs.

1. INTRODUCTION

The growing level of environmental awareness has been leading to a burgeoning focus on green chemistry. In this regard, one important research area is the synthesis and development of greener solvents for a wide number of industrial applications that still make use of classical organic solvents. The most prevalent green solvents studied nowadays include water, supercritical carbon dioxide (CO₂), ionic liquids (ILs), and in the past decade, deep eutectic solvents (DESs).

According to Abbott and co-workers, DESs are a neoteric class of eutectic solvents obtained by mixing two (or more) compounds that exhibit a eutectic temperature far below the melting points of the starting materials, resulting in stable liquids at low temperatures. They assigned this behavior to the charge delocalization induced by strong hydrogen-bonding interactions established between a hydrogen bond donor (HBD) and a hydrogen bond acceptor (HBA) (stronger interactions inducing larger melting temperature depressions). DESs are usually described as solvents with low toxicity, nonflammability, water compatibility, and negligible vapor pressure. Moreover, their simple preparation, operation under mild conditions, low cost, biodegradability, and sustainability are often highlighted. Although some of these characteristics may be arguable as, for instance, their “low toxicity”, DESs have emerged as a promising alternative to organic solvents, breaching a new field of research. The most worthwhile feature of DESs is, analogously to ILs, their tunable character. This means that the phase behavior and physical properties of the solvent can be tuned aiming at a specific application, by a proper selection of HBD/HBA combinations. The most common DES precursors consist of quaternary ammonium salts (mainly choline chloride ([Ch]Cl), due to its low cost,
low toxicity, and biodegradability) as HBAs, combined with different harmless HBDs such as urea and its derivatives, sugars, alcohols or polyols, carboxylic acids, or amino acids.

Recently, many possible applications for DESs have emerged in several research fields such as organic synthesis or catalysis, metal processing, conversion of lignocellulosic biomass, extraction of glycerol from biodiesel, drug vehicles, and gas separations. A reliable knowledge of thermophysical properties and phase equilibria of the DES are necessary for the accurate simulation and/or design of novel industrial processes. However, the mechanisms behind the formation of a DES are still not fully understood, hindering the development of theoretical models able to correctly capture their thermophysical properties and phase equilibria.

In previous works, we characterized the solid–liquid equilibria (SLE) of several eutectic mixtures composed of monofunctional HBD’s, namely, alkan-1-ols and monocarboxylic acids, combined with quaternary ammonium salts. The phase diagrams were experimentally measured and modeled using the equation of state perturbed-chain statistical associating fluid theory (PC-SAFT) or the nonrandom two liquid (NRTL) model. PC-SAFT showed to be the most appropriate given its higher accuracy, and contrarily to NRTL, it can provide densities or be easily coupled with other theories for the calculation of transport or interfacial properties in subsequent studies. By and large, the results showed that, although commonly reported as DES, most of these systems do not show significant deviations from the ideal-mixture behavior and consequently exhibit low melting temperature depressions. Furthermore, no fixed stoichiometry between the HBD and the HBA was observed. Instead, it was shown that the eutectic composition varies depending on the precursors used, being mainly driven by the HBD’s melting properties.

These results reinforce the need for further investigations on the DESs nature. This is of special importance as the literature reports a large number of DESs and their numerous applications while experimental data on their SLE are extremely scarce despite the fundamental information they can provide.

Likewise, the thermodynamic modeling of DESs is a poorly explored research topic. The reason behind this is caused by the limited reliable data available and the complexity of the DESs; for these systems hydrogen-bonding or polar interactions play an important role, which remains challenging for most industrially relevant thermodynamic models currently available.

Promising molecular-based equations of state (EoSs), able to explicitly account for specific molecular interactions such as hydrogen-bonding, have been derived from statistical associating fluid theory (SAFT). Verevin et al. predicted the separation performance of DESs when compared to their parent ionic liquids, by using PC-SAFT to describe the infinite dilution activity coefficients of several solutes in a [Ch]-Cl:glycerol mixture. Zubeir et al. also used PC-SAFT to describe the phase behavior of DESs composed of quaternary ammonium salts and lactic acid in order to predict the solubility of CO2 in them. Two PC-SAFT modeling approaches, the pseudopure component approach and the individual-component approach were considered and compared. The latter allowed binary interaction parameters to be HBD:HBA ratio independent, which is a big advantage compared to applying the pseudopure component approach.

Lloret et al. used soft-SAFT to study the thermophysical properties of DESs composed of tetraalkylammonium chlorides as HBAs and lactic acid, ethylene glycol, or triethylene glycol as HBDs. In their work, density and phase equilibria with CO2 were modeled using the pseudopure component and the individual-component approaches. However, the viscosities and surface tensions of the DESs were modeled only with the pseudopure component approach. Although the pseudopure component modeling approach is easy, the most relevant limitation of this approach is its inability to investigate the solid–liquid (SL) phase behavior, which is of utmost importance for a fundamental knowledge on the DESs essence and to establish temperature and composition limits for practical operations.

In this work, the SL phase diagrams of nine binary mixtures composed of [Ch]Cl and different (poly)carboxylic acids, namely, glycolic, lactic, oxalic, malonic, succinic, glutaric, malic, tartaric, and citric acids were measured using a visual detection technique. The SL phase diagrams were then described using PC-SAFT, which is able to explicitly account for hydrogen-bond interactions between the DES constituents. As the model provided a good description of the data, it was further considered to obtain reliable estimates for the nonideality of the liquid phase and for the eutectic points coordinates. The experimental data along with the modeling results were used to grasp the influence of the polyfunctionality of the HBD on the nonideality of the DES’s liquid phase. Densities and viscosities of the different systems at compositions near the eutectic point were measured at different temperatures.

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1. Materials. The source and purity of the compounds investigated in this work are reported in Table 1. The racemic mixture DL-lactic acid was considered for this study despite its lower purity in order to provide a broader discussion on the influence of the acids structure on the SLE. Nevertheless, the acid was dried prior to use and, thus, the influence of water (the main impurity according with the supplier) was assumed to be negligible. The melting temperatures of the different carboxylic acids used in this work were measured experimentally and are reported in Table 1, along with values from literature. A good agreement between the experimental and literature melting temperatures (Tm) is observed with a maximum deviation of 4.1 K, for malonic acid. The melting enthalpies (∆Hfus) were taken from literature and are also reported in Table 1. Before use, all individual compounds were purified under vacuum (0.1 Pa and 298 K) and constant stirring, for at least 72 h. The water content of the pure compounds was measured using a Metrohm 831 Karl Fischer coulometer, with the analyte Hydranal Coulomat AG from Riedel-de-Haen, and their values are displayed in Table 1.

2.2. Methods. Due to the high hygroscopic character of the pure compounds, their mixtures were prepared inside a dry-argon glovebox at room temperature using an analytical balance model ALS 220-4N from Kern with an accuracy of ±0.002 g. Mixtures were then heated under stirring until complete melting, recrystallized, and grounded inside the glovebox (Figure S1). The crystallization times for the pasty compounds were about 12 h with the exception of the mixture involving citric acid that starts to crystallize upon cooling. The obtained powder was filled into a glass capillary. The melting temperatures were determined using an automatic glass capillary device model M-565 by Bucchi (100–240 V, 50–
60 Hz, 150 W) with a temperature resolution of 0.1 K. A heating rate of 0.1 K-min⁻¹ was used in all cases. For mixtures with a paste-like consistency (Table S1), the vials (5 mL size with approximately 0.3 g of sample) were gradually heated under stirring in an oil bath until a homogeneous liquid was formed, the mixture melting point. The temperature was controlled and measured with a PT100 calibrated against a calibrated platinum resistance thermometer, SPRT100 (Fluke-Hart Scientific), traceable to the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST), with an uncertainty less than 2 × 10⁻³ K. The heating rate used was of 0.1 K min⁻¹. The melting procedures were repeated at least three times with an estimated reproducibility of ±1.5 K.

The water content of the eutectic points of the investigated mixtures was measured after melting using a Metrohm 831 Karl Fischer coulometer, with the analyte Hydranal-Coulomat AG from Riedel-de Haën (Table S2). The water content of the eutectic points of the investigated systems, showing that esterification does not significantly affect the SLE measurements. However, it is important to point out that long-term usage of these mixtures at elevated temperatures might lead to significant esterification.

Densities and viscosities were measured at atmospheric pressure and in the temperature range from 283.15 to 373.15 K using an automated SVM 3000 Anton Paar rotational Stabinger viscometer–densimeter (temperature uncertainty, ±0.02 K; absolute density uncertainty, ±5 × 10⁻⁴ g cm⁻³; dynamic viscosity relative uncertainty, ±0.35%)

3. THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

3.1. PC-SAFT. Cubic equations of state (EoSs) used in industry often fail when applied to describe the thermodynamic behavior and phase equilibria of complex systems where hydrogen-bonding and/or polar interactions play a key role. Due to an ever-increasing number of complex systems of interest to the chemical industry, there is an ongoing demand for more robust and accurate thermodynamic models suitable for broader ranges of applications.

Therefore, although still relatively far from becoming the standard for engineering purposes, molecular-based EoSs having a strong theoretical foundation derived from statistical thermodynamics and able to explicitly account for physical, chain, and association interactions have emerged as the most encouraging alternative to model associating fluids such as DESs. SAFT provides such a concept; it was first implemented as an engineering EoS by Chapman and co-workers in the late 80s based on the first-order thermodynamic perturbation theory (TPT1) proposed by Wertheim. Instead of hard spheres as a reference fluid, PC-SAFT considers a hard chain of freely jointed hard spheres, as reference for the perturbation theory, rather than the individual spherical segments. Thus, for PC-SAFT the residual Helmholtz energy, \( A^{\text{res}} \), can be expressed by eq 1 where \( h_c \) refers to the hard-chain contribution:

\[
A^{\text{res}} = A^{\text{hc}} + A^{\text{dis}} + A^{\text{assoc}}
\]

The hard-chain reference fluid chosen as reference in PC-SAFT, consists of a number of \( m^{\text{th}} \) spherical freely jointed segments (no attractive interactions) accounting for the nonspherical shape of molecules and the repulsive interactions.

The contribution due to dispersive interactions within PC-SAFT is derived from the perturbation theory of Barker and Henderson, and includes two additional parameters, namely, the segment diameter \( \sigma_{\text{seg}} \) and dispersive energy between segments \( \left( u_{\text{seg}} / k_b \right) \). These two parameters along with the number of segments in the chain \( (m_{\text{seg}}) \) are the nonassociative parameters required to fully characterize a nonassociating compound. The size and energy parameters required in the dispersive term for mixtures are obtained under the van der Waals one fluid theory (vdW1) using the Lorentz–Berthelot mixing rules (eqs 2 and 3).

\[
\sigma_{\text{seg}} = \frac{\sigma_{\text{seg}} + \sigma_{\text{disp}}}{2}
\]

\[
u_{\text{seg}} = \sqrt{(1 - k_{\text{disp}}) u_{\text{seg}} u_{\text{seg}}}
\]

The association term introduces two additional parameters, namely, the association well depth \( \varepsilon_{\text{assoc}} \) and association volume \( \kappa_{\text{assoc}} \) that, along with the three nonassociating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compound</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>% wt</th>
<th>H₂O ppm</th>
<th>( T^{\infty} / K )</th>
<th>( \rho^{\infty} / \text{g cm}^{-3} )</th>
<th>( \eta^{\infty} / \text{mPa s} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[ChCl]</td>
<td>Acros Organics</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>639</td>
<td>597.39</td>
<td>4300</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glycolic acid</td>
<td>Sigma-Aldrich</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>359.8 ± 0.2</td>
<td>351.3 ± 1930</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DL - Lactic acid</td>
<td>Riedel-de-Haën</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>523</td>
<td>289.8 ± 0.3</td>
<td>289.9 ± 11340</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxalic acid</td>
<td>JMGOS</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>363</td>
<td>462.4 ± 0.3</td>
<td>462.6 ± 18580</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malonic acid</td>
<td>Fluka</td>
<td>&gt;98</td>
<td>531</td>
<td>411.6 ± 0.4</td>
<td>407.5 ± 23100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Succinic acid</td>
<td>Merck</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>463</td>
<td>460.7 ± 0.2</td>
<td>460.1 ± 32950</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glutaric acid</td>
<td>Sigma</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>584</td>
<td>379.6 ± 0.2</td>
<td>370.9 ± 20700</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malic acid</td>
<td>Riedel-de-Haën</td>
<td>99.5</td>
<td>570</td>
<td>404.3 ± 0.1</td>
<td>402.4 ± 33520</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tartaric acid</td>
<td>Acros Organics</td>
<td>99.5</td>
<td>492</td>
<td>445.3 ± 0.2</td>
<td>445.0 ± 36310</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinnic acid</td>
<td>Fisher Scientific</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>427.5 ± 0.3</td>
<td>427.8 ± 40320</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Source, Purity, and Melting Properties of the Chemicals Used in This Work

Industrial & Engineering Chemistry Research

DOI: 10.1021/acs.iecr.8b01249


11197
parameters, fully describe a self-associating component, as those present in DESs.

The extension of the association term to mixtures requires the evaluation of the cross-association parameters, which are generally obtained from the pure-component association parameters using appropriate mixing rules such as those of Wolbach and Sandler.\(^{30}\)

\[
e^{ijkl} = \frac{1}{2} (\epsilon^{ikij} + \epsilon^{jlij})(1 - k_{ij,\text{esp}})
\]

(4)

\[
k^{ijkl} = \sqrt{k_{ikij}k_{jlij}} \left( \frac{\sigma_i \sigma_j}{\sigma_l} \right)^{\frac{3}{2}} \left( \frac{1}{2} \left( \sigma_i + \sigma_j \right) \right)
\]

(5)

For further details on the PC-SAFT EoS and its implementation, we refer to the original PC-SAFT publications by Gross and Sadowski.\(^{27,51}\)

One clear advantage of an EoS written in terms of the residual chemical potentials, and fugacity coefficients required to perform phase equilibria calculations can be obtained using the following equations:

\[
Z = 1 + \eta \left( \frac{\partial \tilde{\alpha}^{\text{res}}}{\partial \eta} \right)_{T,Vm}
\]

(6)

\[
\frac{\mu_k^{\text{res}}(T,Vm)}{RT} = \tilde{\alpha}^{\text{res}} + (Z - 1) + \left( \frac{\partial \tilde{\alpha}^{\text{res}}}{\partial \xi_k} \right)_{T,Vm,x_{\text{res}}}
\]

\[\sum_{j=1}^{N_C} x_j \left( \frac{\partial \tilde{\alpha}^{\text{res}}}{\partial \xi_j} \right)_{T,Vm,x_{\text{res}}}
\]

(7)

\[
\ln(p_{\text{eq}}) = \frac{\mu_k^{\text{res}}(T,Vm)}{RT} - \ln(Z)
\]

(8)

where \(\tilde{\alpha}^{\text{res}}\) is the molar residual Helmholtz energy, \(V_m\) is the molar volume, \(\eta\) is the reduced density, \(Z\) is the compressibility factor, \(\mu_k^{\text{res}}\) is the residual chemical potential of component \(k\), and \(p_{\text{eq}}\) is its fugacity coefficient.

### 3.2. PC-SAFT Pure-Component Parameters

The pure-component parameters required for PC-SAFT modeling are generally regressed from pure-component experimental data (saturated liquid densities and vapor pressures in the 0.4–0.9 reduced temperature range are used in most cases). However, for compounds that are solid at low temperatures, as is the case of \([\text{Ch}]\text{Cl}\) and most of the (poly)carboxylic acids investigated here, liquid densities are not available and their pure-component parameters need to be regressed either from vapor pressure data only or from binary VLE or LLE data with a solvent for which parameters are readily available (e.g., water). Both approaches have their shortcomings: using only vapor pressure data would mean regressing up to five parameters from experimental data corresponding to a single thermodynamic property while, in the latter approach, the obtained parameters may be strongly influenced by the mixtures physical features and a binary interaction parameter may be simultaneously fitted so that a quantitative agreement is obtained.

These problems can, in some cases, be mitigated as the associative parameters may be transferable within a homologous series of compounds where the same kind of interactions are present. However, the (poly)carboxylic acids investigated here differ from each other by different chain lengths and by different numbers of hydroxyl and carboxylic groups in their molecular structure (Table 1), which may prevent a successful transfer of associative parameters between the acids.

When PC-SAFT parameters for self-associating components are regressed, exceptional care is needed since the number and type of association sites of a molecule, as well as the possible site-to-site interactions, need to be specified a priori; these might have a tremendous impact on the modeling results. These “association schemes” should be carefully chosen on the basis of the molecular picture and known interactions, as NMR spectroscopy data are rarely available.

In the framework of PC-SAFT, several authors\(^{16,31,52–54}\) have represented salts and ionic liquids as associative compounds using a 2B association scheme (according to Huang and Radosz\(^{55}\)). 2B means that two association sites (one donor and one acceptor) are assigned to the considered component, while allowing for unlike interactions in the system. Regarding the components in the present work, pure-component parameters for \([\text{Ch}]\text{Cl}\) with the 2B scheme were already available from the work of Zubeir et al.\(^{31}\) (as reported in Table 2); these were directly used also in the present work.

For the modeling of carboxylic acids, both the 1A and 2B association schemes were previously considered in the literature, and the 2B scheme (the same applied to alkan-1-ols) was suggested as the more appropriate.\(^{16,56,57}\) As some of the (poly)carboxylic acids studied here contain both carboxylic and hydroxyl groups (hydroxy acids), two association sites (of different nature as in the 2B scheme) are added per each one of these groups. A sketch of the resulting association scheme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>M/A (g mol(^{-1}))</th>
<th>no. of sites A/B</th>
<th>(m^#)</th>
<th>(\sigma) Å</th>
<th>(u) K</th>
<th>(\epsilon^A) K</th>
<th>(\epsilon^B) K</th>
<th>(%) AARD(p)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[Ch]Cl</td>
<td>139.62</td>
<td>1/1</td>
<td>13.02</td>
<td>2.368</td>
<td>228.07</td>
<td>8000</td>
<td>0.200</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glycolic acid</td>
<td>76.05</td>
<td>2/2</td>
<td>5.609</td>
<td>2.914</td>
<td>216.44</td>
<td>1850</td>
<td>0.020</td>
<td>6.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lactic acid</td>
<td>90.08</td>
<td>1/1</td>
<td>4.800</td>
<td>2.851</td>
<td>275.53</td>
<td>100.2</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxalic acid</td>
<td>90.04</td>
<td>2/2</td>
<td>3.358</td>
<td>2.749</td>
<td>180.14</td>
<td>1655</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malonic acid</td>
<td>104.06</td>
<td>2/2</td>
<td>4.428</td>
<td>2.818</td>
<td>300.16</td>
<td>2125</td>
<td>0.023</td>
<td>3.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Succinic acid</td>
<td>118.09</td>
<td>2/2</td>
<td>4.335</td>
<td>3.055</td>
<td>477.44</td>
<td>1702</td>
<td>0.020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glutaric acid</td>
<td>132.12</td>
<td>2/2</td>
<td>4.437</td>
<td>2.799</td>
<td>257.67</td>
<td>1762</td>
<td>0.020</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malic acid</td>
<td>134.09</td>
<td>3/3</td>
<td>4.611</td>
<td>2.987</td>
<td>204.83</td>
<td>3163</td>
<td>0.027</td>
<td>3.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tartaric acid</td>
<td>150.09</td>
<td>4/4</td>
<td>7.637</td>
<td>2.532</td>
<td>204.56</td>
<td>2963</td>
<td>0.040</td>
<td>0.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citric acid</td>
<td>192.12</td>
<td>4/4</td>
<td>8.546</td>
<td>2.723</td>
<td>227.18</td>
<td>2488</td>
<td>0.044</td>
<td>2.25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{a}\)Parameters regressed in this work.
for citric acid is presented in Figure 1, where the A and B notation are used to differentiate association sites of opposite nature; among two equal components as well as between two unlike components, only A and B are allowed to interact.

As mentioned above, the different molecular structures of the (poly)carboxylic acids hinder the transferability of association parameters and, thus, the five pure-component parameters for glycolic, malonic, malic, tartaric, and citric acids were regressed from pure-compound vapor pressure data, where the quality of the fit is depicted in Figure 2, along with one density point whenever available according to Table 3. As depicted in Figure 2, the parameters obtained allowed for a good description of the experimental data and are reported in Table 2, along with the percentage average absolute relative deviation (%AARD) to the experimental vapor pressures. The highest deviation was observed for glycolic acid for which no or little influence, while for [Ch]Cl Martins et al.63 recently presented a detailed analysis over a large number of different binary systems with [Ch]Cl concluding that the heat-capacity change in most cases has no relevant influence.

Therefore, assuming that $I$ and $\Delta C^d_{pk}$ are negligible eq 9 can be further simplified:

$$x_k^l = \exp\left\{\frac{\Delta H^d_{pk}}{RT_{mk}} \left(\frac{T - T_{mk}}{T}\right) + \frac{\Delta C^d_{pk}}{R} \int \left(\frac{T}{T_{mk}}\right) \right\}$$

(10)

According to eq 10, the solubility of a solid solute can be easily obtained as a function of the solute melting properties, temperature and composition of the liquid phase. The activity coefficients of a component $k$ in the liquid phase, which are a function of temperature and composition, are obtained from an EoS as the ratio between the fugacity coefficients of component $k$ in the mixture and that of the pure compound, as follows:

$$\gamma_k^l(T, P, x) = \frac{q_k^l(T, P, x)}{q_k^l(T, P, x_k = 1)}$$

(11)

Equation 9 neglects the existence of any solid—solid transitions, but some of the studied components do show polymorphic behavior. According to the literature, five of the compounds studied in this work present solid—solid transitions, namely, [Ch]Cl,64,65 oxalic,66 malonic,35,66,67 succinic,35,66,68 glutaric acids.

For [Ch]Cl there are no values of the transition enthalpy reported in literature while for succinic acid the transition temperature is lower than the eutectic point of the binary system [Ch]Cl + succinic acid. For the remaining acids, the solid—solid transitions were not included given that the transition enthalpies typically reported are within the uncertainty of the fusion enthalpy.

Hence, given the scarcity and uncertainty of the solid—solid transition temperatures and enthalpies, it is yet inadequate to explicitly account for them in eq 9.

### 4. RESULTS

The nine solid—liquid phase diagrams measured in this work for binary mixtures composed of [Ch]Cl and (poly)carboxylic acids are depicted in Figure 3. All phase diagrams exhibit a phase behavior characterized by a single eutectic, as commonly observed for most crystallizing systems. The detailed SLE data are reported in the Supporting Information (Table S1) along with the experimental activity coefficients calculated through
At some compositions, the mixture [Ch]Cl + lactic acid is liquid at room temperature. Thus, to measure the complete phase diagram, another experimental technique (differential scanning calorimetry) was used. However, these mixtures do not crystallize, forming glasses instead, preventing the measurement of the complete SLE phase diagram of the system [Ch]Cl-lactic acid.

Abbott et al. reported the freezing temperatures for the systems [Ch]Cl + oxalic acid, [Ch]Cl + malonic acid, and [Ch]Cl + succinic acid in a small composition range. As depicted in Figure 3, near the eutectic point, the data from literature are in good agreement with those measured in this work. However, larger discrepancies are observed for higher concentrations of [Ch]Cl, which may be partly related to the hygroscopic character of this compound, as the higher the water content is, the lower is the melting temperature. The mixtures investigated here were carefully prepared and manipulated inside a dry-argon glovebox just right to introduce the mixture powder into the capillary tube, immediately before

eq 10, using the solubility measurements \((x, T)\) and melting data.

At some compositions, the mixture \([\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{lactic acid}\) is liquid at room temperature. Thus, to measure the complete phase diagram, another experimental technique (differential scanning calorimetry) was used. However, these mixtures do not crystallize, forming glasses instead, preventing the measurement of the complete SLE phase diagram of the system \([\text{Ch}]\text{Cl}-\text{lactic acid}\).

Abbott et al. reported the freezing temperatures for the systems \([\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{oxalic acid}, [\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{malonic acid}, \text{and } [\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{succinic acid}\) in a small composition range. As depicted in Figure 3, near the eutectic point, the data from literature are in good agreement with those measured in this work. However, larger discrepancies are observed for higher concentrations of \([\text{Ch}]\text{Cl}\), which may be partly related to the hygroscopic character of this compound, as the higher the water content is, the lower is the melting temperature. The mixtures investigated here were carefully prepared and manipulated inside a dry-argon glovebox just right to introduce the mixture powder into the capillary tube, immediately before
Figure 3. continued
Figure 3. continued
the measurement of the melting temperature. Moreover, the pure components were dried before the mixtures preparation, being the water content always lower than 639 ppm (Table 1).

Assuming an ideal liquid phase (i.e., $\gamma_k = 1$), ideal solubility curves can be obtained from eq 10 as a function of the system temperature and the solute melting properties; these curves are also displayed in Figure 3, evidencing the presence of significant negative deviations from the ideal behavior, as the experimental melting temperatures are systematically lower than those calculated assuming an ideal behavior, especially for the acid solubility curve. For most systems, the [Ch]Cl solubility curves present smaller deviations from the ideal-mixture behavior, with activity coefficients close to 1, but the departure to ideality increases considerably for tartaric and citric acids. The reason behind this is probably the very high number of functional groups that are able to form hydrogen bonds with [Ch]Cl (four between hydroxyl and carboxylic groups). These results suggest that additional functional groups in the HBD’s structure may play a vital role for inducing a higher nonideality in [Ch]Cl-based DESs. This assumption is supported by our previous work, on mixtures of [Ch]Cl with monocarboxylic acids; these were shown to have a nearly ideal behavior, exhibiting very small deviations.

Figure 3. Solid–liquid phase diagrams (left side) for the binary mixtures composed of [Ch]Cl and different carboxylic acids. On the right side the activity coefficients of both species are shown. The symbols represent the experimental data of this work (see Table S1) while the solid lines depict the PC-SAFT results using the parameters from Table 2 and Table 4, and the dashed lines represent the ideal-mixture behavior.
from ideal behavior, and often a negligible melting temperature depression.

Considering the nonideality of the systems investigated here, PC-SAFT was used to model the experimental phase diagrams and, as depicted in Figure 3, an accurate description of the experimental data was obtained by using up to two temperature independent binary interaction parameters ($k_i$ and $k_{i,j,eps}$) (Table 4).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System</th>
<th>PC-SAFT Binary Parameters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{glycolic acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.0300$ $-0.0210$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{lactic acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.1000$ $-0.0450$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{malonic acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.0350$ $-0.0450$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{succinic acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.0120$ $-0.0600$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{glutaric acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.0175$ $-0.0200$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{malic acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.0950$ $-0.0100$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{tartaric acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.1270$ $0.0100$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl} + \text{citric acid}$</td>
<td>$-0.0675$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The accuracy of PC-SAFT to describe the SLE data can be evaluated through the deviations between the calculated ($T_{calc}$) and experimental melting temperatures ($T_{exp}$). The deviations are reported in terms of average absolute deviation (AAD) given by eq 12, where $N$ is the total number of experimental data points for each system. The AAD was also used as the objective function to be minimized while fitting the binary interaction parameters for each system.

$$\text{AAD}(K) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} |T_i^{calc}(K) - T_i^{exp}(K)|$$

(12)

Figure 4 shows the AAD values obtained between experimental data and ideal-mixture behavior as well as between experimental data and PC-SAFT modeling. As a consequence of the highly nonideal behavior character of the eutectic mixtures studied here, the use of PC-SAFT results in a considerable decrease of the AAD (in a factor of 1.7 up to 6.5) when compared to the ideal solubility curves.

Considering the large temperature intervals involved (more than 300 K), very acceptable deviations of the melting temperatures calculated by PC-SAFT compared to the experimental data (similar to those obtained in our previous works$^{[12,16]}$) were obtained. The systems presenting higher deviations are those with malonic, oxalic, or succinic acid, which are those presenting melting temperature depressions of higher magnitude and a higher asymmetry; i.e., the salt’s solubility curve is fairly ideal while the acid’s solubility curve presents significant negative deviations from the ideal behavior (Table S1). In fact, for most systems, PC-SAFT systematically overpredicted the melting temperatures in both solubility curves (and thus the activity coefficients of HBD and HBA). This required the use of negative binary interaction parameters that increase the energy of interaction between the molecules in comparison to the model predictions, which corresponds to a nearly ideal behavior, as depicted in Figure S3. Thus, the obtained values for the fitted binary parameters (Table 4) reinforce the existence of strong interactions between the two components that, ultimately, lead to the formation of a DES. Although both binary interaction parameters can be related to an increase of cross interactions between HBA and HBD, they have a different effect upon the phase behavior of the system. Thus, both the $k_{ij}$ which increases the cross-dispersive energy, and $k_{i,j,eps}$ increasing the cross-association energies, were required to successfully capture the experimental data. The reason for this was the highly unsymmetrical phase behavior of these systems; i.e., considerably higher deviations from the ideal behavior were observed for the solubility curve of the acid than that of $[\text{Ch}]\text{Cl}$.

As it was proven that PC-SAFT provides an accurate description of the experimental phase diagrams over the whole concentration range, it can be further used to assess reliable estimates of the eutectic points. The eutectic point coordinates ($x_{HBD}^{e}$, $T_{exp}^{e}$) obtained by PC-SAFT are represented in Figure 5 and reported in Table S3 along with those assuming an ideal behavior. As can be seen in Figure 5A, the eutectic composition of the different DES depends strongly on the kind of carboxylic acid used but, with the exception of the mixture with lactic acid, the eutectic compositions are roughly located in the range from 0.3 to 0.5 of acid mole fractions. A similar trend of the ideal behavior predictions is followed, except for mixtures involving dicarboxylic acids, whose eutectic compositions are considerably higher than those predicted by assuming an ideal behavior. These results show that the eutectic composition on these DESs is mainly controlled by the HBD’s chemical structure and rarely corresponds to a fixed HBA/HBD ratio, even for compounds from the same family. This highlights the importance of studying the solid—liquid phase behavior of DESs with special focus on the experimental determination of the whole phase diagram for a correct assessment of the eutectic points, prior to the application of DESs. Moreover, the phase diagrams allow the identification of the compositions that are liquid at operating temperature and thus can be used as solvents.

Similarly, the PC-SAFT estimated eutectic temperatures (Figure 5B) seem to depend on the type of carboxylic acid qualitatively the same as those predicted assuming an ideal liquid phase, although larger discrepancies are observed between PC-SAFT estimated eutectic temperatures, $T_{calc}^{e}$ and those assuming an ideal-mixture behavior, $T_{ideal}^{e}$. The
ideal eutectic temperatures are, as previously shown for eutectic mixtures of [Ch]Cl + fatty acids, mainly determined by the melting temperatures of the pure acids. In contrast, the eutectic temperatures assessed with PC-SAFT suggest that $T_E$ might result from a combined effect of the acid bulk size, the number of functional groups within the HBD, and the molecular interactions between acid molecules. Results clearly show that the eutectic temperatures increase with the HBD’s molar volume (e.g., malonic acid < succinic acid < malic acid < citric acid) while they may or may not decrease with the number of functional groups present in the HBD (e.g., tartaric acid < malic acid but succinic acid < malic acid). The effect of the number of functional groups present in the HBD is not straightforward. For instance, the eutectic temperature of the system [Ch]Cl + tartaric acid is lower than that observed for the mixture [Ch]Cl + citric acid, although the melting temperature of pure tartaric acid is 15 K higher than that of citric acid. Both tartaric acid and citric acid contain four functional groups (between hydroxyl and carboxylic groups) able to interact with [Ch]Cl; however, the self-association interactions in the pure acid are much stronger in citric acid than in tartaric acid due to the presence of more COOH–COOH interactions in comparison to the comparatively weaker OH–OH interactions. This is also the reason for the fact that the activity coefficients of tartaric acid (in Figure 3) are lower than those of citric acid, despite that both acids induce similar deviations from ideal behavior on the activity coefficient of [Ch]Cl. These results suggest that although the number of functional groups play a vital role in inducing negative deviations from the ideal behavior in the [Ch]Cl solubility (also highlighted by the nearly ideal behavior of the mixtures with glycolic or lactic acid), both the number and the type of functional groups, and interactions present in the pure HBD, have a strong influence on the solubility of the HBD in the DES and thus on the eutectic temperatures.

The melting temperature depressions ($\Delta T^E = T^E_{\text{ideal}} - T^E_{\text{EoS}}$) to the ideal behavior predictions are depicted in Figure 5C; values between 0.81 K ([Ch]Cl + lactic acid) and 93.86 K ([Ch]Cl + tartaric acid) can be observed from this figure. The highest melting temperature depressions are observed for the systems with tartaric acid or smaller dicarboxylic acids (oxalic, malonic, or succinic acids). The former benefits from a higher number of functional groups, and from the presence of OH–OH interactions in the pure acid, weaker than those established with [Ch]Cl. However, the smaller dicarboxylic acids benefit from a win–win combination of the different effects: they have a small chain length combined with an optimal number of functional groups, which are just sufficient to prevent positive deviations from ideality in the [Ch]Cl solubility (contrarily to monofunctional HBDs), without considerably increasing the magnitude of self-interactions in the pure HBD as it is the case for citric and malic acids. These
results suggest that the effect of an increasing number of functional groups (which has a positive impact on the [Ch]Cl solubility) is counterbalanced by the stronger interactions established in the pure HBD. Nevertheless, the very large melting temperature depressions observed for most systems allow the formation of stable liquids at low temperatures; the studied mixtures exhibit eutectic temperatures in the range 265.4–336.0 K.

As stated before, the SL phase diagrams of DES are extremely scarce, but extremely important to check the composition range where the binary mixture can be a stable liquid around room temperature. Regarding the systems investigated here, Abbott et al.13 presented a few data points of the SLE of mixtures of [Ch]Cl with oxalic, malonic, or succinic acids (Figure 3), and some other (poly)carboxylic acids have been used as HBD to form [Ch]Cl-based DES. Data measured in this work are generally in agreement with the data published by Abbott et al.13 Both works agree that while [Ch]Cl + malonic acid melts around 274 K at the eutectic composition, [Ch]Cl + succinic or oxalic acids do not form a liquid at room temperature, as it was also stated by Florindo et al.14 for succinic acid + [Ch]Cl. Conversely, both Florindo et al.14 and Aroso et al.69 report the formation of liquids at room temperatures for the DESs [Ch]Cl + citric acid and [Ch]Cl + tartaric acid in different HBD/HBA ratios, while our data indicate a eutectic point around 307 and 336 K for the eutectic mixtures with tartaric and citric acids, respectively. Unfortunately, further discussions on these discrepancies are difficult due to the lack of experimental details, in particular the water content of their mixtures, and the absence of more information on these systems in the open literature.

Densities and viscosities of the eutectic mixtures were determined at atmospheric pressure in the temperature range between 283.15 and 373.15 K and are reported in Figure 6 and Tables S4 and S5 of the Supporting Information, along with the mole fraction of the acids. All mixtures studied are denser than water and both, densities and viscosities decrease with increasing temperature. The mixtures involving lactic and tartaric acids are the less and more dense, respectively. The same is observed for viscosities. In general, the viscosity decreases with the decrease of the number or functional groups: tartaric, citric, and malic acids are more viscous, followed by succinic, glutaric, malonic, and oxalic acids.

The high viscosities of the systems studied are related with the strong hydrogen bonds between the components. Their large size lead to small void volumes and, therefore, lower mobility of the species. As shown before for systems involving sugars,20 the addition of water to these systems decreases their densities and viscosities due to the formation of a higher number of potential hydrogen bonds between the solutes and water. Thus, this type of system can easily be tuned into systems with enhanced transport properties for industrial applications. However, it should be pointed out that the addition of water strongly influences the phase behavior21 and thus the phase boundaries should be re-evaluated at the desired water content.

5. CONCLUSIONS

Binary mixtures composed of [Ch]Cl and one of nine (poly)carboxylic acids were prepared and the SL phase diagrams measured using a visual detection technique. Contrarily to the nearly ideal behavior reported for binary mixtures of [Ch]Cl and fatty acids, the systems investigated here exhibit strong negative deviations from ideality, resulting in considerable melting temperature depressions that may lead to the formation of stable liquids at relatively low temperatures (some even at room temperature). These results highlight the importance of using multifunctional hydrogen bond donors to establish stronger cross-interactions in the mixtures than those observed in the pure compounds.

The experimental phase diagrams were modeled with PC-SAFT, which has been shown to be an accurate tool for the thermodynamic description of the studied DES. The model required a maximum of two temperature-independent binary interaction parameters between HBA and HBD in order to capture the system’s physical features. All interaction parameters were found to have negative values highlighting the strong cross-interactions between the DES constituents. An exception was the system with tartaric acid where a positive \( k_{ij} \) was required due to the highly negative \( k_{ij} \). Moreover, the model was used to assess the eutectic points coordinates (temperature and composition) that were compared with those expected for an ideal mixture. Similarly to our findings with [Ch]Cl + fatty acids systems, no fixed stoichiometry HBD:HBA was found at the eutectic point. The eutectic temperature depressions were found to result from a combined effect of the bulk size, number and type of functional groups of the HBD. Further systematic studies on the impact of each of
these variables would contribute with fundamental information for an efficient computer-aided design of [Ch]Cl-based DES.

**ASSOCIATED CONTENT**

1. **Supporting Information**

The Supporting Information is available free of charge on the ACS Publications website at DOI: 10.1021/acs.iecr.8b01249.

Tables of experimental ($\chi_p$, $T$) and calculated ($\gamma_2$) data of the SLE of systems, water content of the eutectic points, eutectic point coordinates, and experimental density and viscosity results; photograph of investigated mixtures at the eutectic composition; $^1$H NMR spectra; SLE phase diagram (PDF).

**AUTHOR INFORMATION**

**Corresponding Author**

*J. A. P. Coutinho. E-mail: jcoutinho@ua.pt. Phone: +351 234401507. Fax: +351 234370084.

**ORCID**

Emanuel A. Crespo: 0000-0003-2137-0564
Mónia A. R. Martins: 0000-0003-0748-1612
Christoph Held: 0000-0003-1074-177X
Simão P. Pinho: 0000-0002-9211-857X
João A. P. Coutinho: 0000-0002-3841-743X

**Notes**

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This work was developed in the scope of the project CICECO – Aveiro Institute of Materials, POCI-01-0145-FEDER-007679 (ref. FCT UID/CTM/50011/2013) and Associate Laboratory LSRE-LCM, POCI-01-0145-FEDER-006984 (ref. FCT UID/CTM/50011/2013), both financed by national funds through the FCT/MEC and when appropriate cofinanced by FEDER under the PT2020 Partnership Agreement. This work is also a result of project “AlProc-Matq@N2020 - Advanced Industrial Processes and Materials for a Sustainable Northern Region of Portugal 2020”, with the reference NORTE-01-0145-FEDER-000006, supported by Norte Portugal Regional Operational Programme (NORTE 2020), under the Portugal 2020 Partnership Agreement, through the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF). M.A.R.M and E.A.C acknowledge FCT for the Ph.D. grants SFRH/BD/87084/2012 and SFRH/BD/130870/2017, respectively. FCT is also acknowledged for funding the project DeepBioRefinery (PTDC/AGRTEC/1191/2014). C.H. gratefully acknowledges financial support from the Max-Buchner Research Foundation and from German Science Foundation (DFG), grant HE 7165/7-1.

**REFERENCES**


